Abstract
The main purpose of the present quasi-experimental study was to investigate the effects of linear process versus genre-based approach on EFL learners’ written production. To this end, 40 learners of English at intermediate level were randomly selected as the participants of the study and assigned into two groups of experimental (process and genre) which received different types of instruction for 8 sessions. Narrative and process-tasks were employed to collect data from the participants. The collected written data was quantified in terms of the accuracy measure. Independent samples T-test was employed as the statistical means of analysis. The results of the study revealed no difference between the performances of two groups in written narrative task, however, the result of statistical analysis in process task was significant. The study might carry some pedagogical implications for second language teachers, SLA researchers, teacher education and task designers.

Keywords: genre-approach, process, accuracy, learner, written production task
Introduction

Over the past three decades, a major paradigm shift has emerged in second or foreign language writing research and pedagogy. During the 1980s, applied linguists’ growing interest was placed primarily on what has come to become as the process approach, a central principle of much writing pedagogy which resulted in writer-centered classrooms with an emphasis on facilitating the planning and production stage of writing through the linear process to a recognition of prewriting, drafting, revising, and editing (Zamel, 1982). In the 1990s, however, much of the theoretical and pedagogical focus altered to a social approach and to the analyses of a variety of situations in which writing takes place (Trimbur, 1994; Tardy, 2011). Accordingly, SLA scholars’ attention turned to how a written text is shaped by a writers’ response to the most appropriate linguistic resources of a social context, an important perspective that was disregarded in the process approach (McCabe & Whittaker, 2006; Taguchi, 2008). This new paradigm has been labeled as the genre-based approach in the field of second and foreign language writing (Atkinson, 2003; Casanave, 2003; Matsuda, Canagarajah, Harklau, Hyland, & Warschauer, 2003).


The main pedagogical concern of the genre-based approach is to encourage students to pay attention to the context and organization of the text. While product, process, and genre-based have been three general writing approaches to teaching and learning in language classroom, acquiring full systematic proficiency in writing ability seems unfeasible. Despite such strong claims for and against explicit teaching of genres in an EFL context, there have been few studies on what specific kind of genre knowledge students demonstrate when
they receive explicit instruction of genres in EFL contexts. The present study explores a particular view of genre-driven Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) pedagogy and its practical applications for some aspects of writing approaches in an EFL context. Thus the main purpose of the study is to investigate the effect of linear process versus genre-based approach on intermediate Iranian EFL learners’ written task production.

Some researchers have recently argued that genre and its application has become one of the most important and influential concept in the area of second language teaching and learning (Nunan, 1993; McCarthy & Carter, 1994; Burns, Joyce, & Gollin, 1996; Hyland, 2003, 2004, 2007; Gentil, 2005; Tardy, 2005, 2006, 2009; Martin & Rose, 2008; Dovey, 2010). Johns (2002) argued that Genre-based approaches to writing instruction have brought about a major paradigm shift in literacy studies and teaching. Genre-based approaches to writing instruction are informed by theoretical insights from genre studies. Johns (2003), documented that genre studies have traditionally referred to both analyses of the conventions of formal properties, style, rhetorical characterization, plot structure, and other language features of particular genre and variations in conventions within a single genre across time. Recently, however, the field of rhetorical genre studies expanded the notion of genre to refer to a shared social practice recognized by a discourse community in which its members engage with one shared genre to make their membership (Swales, 1990, p. 33). Therefore, this area is an area of investigation, especially with systemic functional linguistic theory over the past two decades (Halliday & Hasan, 1989).

The notion of genre has been variously defined by different scholars in the field of SLA.

Swales (1990) defines it as a class of communicative events characterized by a sequence of segments with each move accomplishing some part of the overall communicative purpose of the text, which tends to produce distinctive structural patterns. Communicative purpose is both a privileged criterion and one that operates to keep the scope of a genre as here concentrated on comparable rhetorical action (Swales, 1990, p. 58).

Hyland (2007) defines genre in an operational way as follows:

Genre refers to abstract, socially recognized ways of using language; it is based on the idea that members of a community usually have little
difficulty in recognizing similarities in the texts they use frequently and are able to draw on their repeated experiences with such texts to read, understand, and perhaps write them relatively easily (Hyland, 2007). Bhatia (1993) suggests that Genre is a recognizable communicative event characterized by a set of communicative events identified by the members of community in which it regularly occurs. These constraints, however, are often exploited by the expert members of the discourse community to achieve private intentions within the framework of socially recognized purposes. (Bhatia, 1993, p.13)

There are three broad approaches to genre theory in the non-literary tradition of genre, each with its own classification of assumptions about genre, research focuses, and the target learners (Hyon, 1996). The three orientations are, the Australian Sydney school (Systemic Functional Linguistics), English for Specific Purposes approach, and the New Rhetoric approach developed in North American composition contexts. SFL view of genre more systematically articulates than the other two approaches to genre the precise relationship between language and content, in that it offers more explicit tools for identifying the lexico-grammatical features that are relevant in the construction of different kinds of text types or genres as shaped by particular contexts (Martin, 2009; Martin & Rose, 2008). Basically, Halliday’s theory systematically links language to its contexts of use, studying how language varies from one context to another and, within that variation, the underlying patterns which organize texts so they are culturally and socially recognized as performing particular functions. The exploration and description of these patterns and their variations has been the focus of genre theory and the resources it exploits to provide disadvantaged learners with access to the cultural capital of socially valued genres.

Harman (2013) emphasized the effectiveness of genre in teaching of narrative texts to L2 learners in writing ability. In addition, de Oliveira & Lan (2014) argued that genre-based method promoted learners’ independence as writers at the same time, it encourages teachers to explicitly teach how a certain genre is linguistically constructed. In a similar study Wang & Yasuda (2013) articulated that teaching explicit genre knowledge enhanced not only writing proficiency in a specific macro genre but also the learners’ awareness of
distinctive language use in different macro-genres. Genre-based teaching offers learners an explicit understanding of how texts in target genres are structured and why they are written in certain ways. Through explicit genre-based instruction, teachers can achieve means of understanding, using, and critiquing texts (Hyland, 2004).

Ding Eng Na (2009) investigated the effectiveness of using genre-based approach on EFL learners’ written production in the English for Specific Purpose (ESP) context. The 30 participants in the control group were taught through the usual lecturing style while the 35 experimental group were taught using the genre-based approach. The results of the study indicated that learners write better when they are made aware of the rhetoric structure and providing models of the communicative moves considered by the learners for inclusion in their texts. In addition, Kongpetch (2006) studied using a genre-approach to teach writing to EFL students. He provided insights into the impact of the genre-based approach and implications for applying it to other educational contexts. Burns (2001) described different tasks and procedures, which were highly genre-based oriented. The results supported the effectiveness of the genre approach, with a clear idea of what language features should be expressed and how the content should be organized.

From the perspective of teachers’ knowledge, little information has been available on the curriculum, syllabi, materials or tasks, and goals of the genre-based classrooms, even across the extensive number of studies that have been conducted in ESL contexts. Therefore, much remains to be clarified regarding what students accomplish at the end of the genre-based course, how teaching might influence their writing development, what kinds of writing tasks and materials are most appropriate to students at what particular time, and most importantly, whether the necessary learning takes place for all students by the end of the genre-based course. The degree to which FL writers’ genre learning contributes to their learning of language and writing is a crucial area in the L2 writing research agenda that needs to be further explored. Bearing the gap in the literature in mind, specifically, investigation of two approaches (process, and genre) could contribute to SLA literature to provide theoretical and pedagogical insights into how instruction that is guided by the notion of genre and tasks plays a role in facilitating FL writers’ language and writing development.
This study aims at addressing the following research questions:

RQ1: Are linear process and genre-based approaches differentially effective in the improvement of accuracy in narrative-task writing among intermediate EFL learners?

RQ2: Are linear process, and genre-based approaches differentially effective in the improvement of accuracy in process-task writing among intermediate EFL learners?

Method

Participants

For the purpose of the study 40 female intermediate learners of English as a foreign language affiliated to language institute. The syllabus in this institute was a communicative conversation course with the aim of developing general English (four corners series, Richards & Bohlke 2012). Learners were selected on the basis of their performance on Oxford Proficiency Test (OPT) (2005) administered among 100 EFL learners of English at intermediate level of language proficiency. They had the same experience of language learning background for 4-5 years in the same institute. However, the researcher administered OPT to ensure the homogeneity of the participants. Having administered OPT, based on their scores, the researcher divided the participants into two instructional experimental groups of process who received a wide range of feedback on their grammatical, lexical, and pronunciation problems and genre-based group who received the genre moves of the text with the help of the teacher.

Instrumentation

The data collection instruments included narrative writing tasks. The types of task were selected on the basis of the purpose of the study. Test takers were asked to write their own narrative composition based on a topic similar to the theme of the reading passages. It was based on what they had learned about genre characteristics (e.g., certain moves). In the process tasks, test takers were asked to describe the steps in a process start with the first step and carry through the last one. These tasks had been designed and were considered to be
valid because all tasks employed for data collection were originally written by native speakers.

**Procedure**

Having been divided into 2 groups of process, and genre-based writing groups, the learners received treatment for 8 sessions of 2-hour instruction on the communicative focused in units 1-3 of Four Corners Book 4. The participants in the genre group were asked to identify and underline the genres moves of the text with the help of the teacher. The next phase of the instruction was the teachers’ explanation of the move, its functional orientation, and the linguistic forms used in the text. And in the last phase, the learners in genre group individually were asked to do writing task at home according to the principles worked in classroom. It was based on what they had learned about genre characteristics (e.g., certain moves).

4 sessions devoted to each genre and the fourth task related to each genre was considered as the means of data collection. Learners had about 15 minutes to prepare the final draft and edit it individually. Finally, each student wrote another composition at home, based on the topic offered by the teacher and delivered it to the teacher for further comments and feedback. The topic of these compositions were similar to the topics they wrote composition in the classroom. Learners developed understanding of text forms as genres and formats provide them with the tools they needed to express themselves effectively and to reach their target audience. Through direct instruction, the teacher provides students with an understanding of how different aspects of a piece of writing – including the theme or topic, the audience, the purpose of writing, and the form – all relate to one another. Effective writers make connections to prior knowledge, other texts, and the world around them as they draft their writing.

Following extracts related to process and narrative task are provided below.

**process writing task.** Paper is made from wood, and many of the worlds’ paper mills are found in those countries which have great forests- Canada, Sweden, and Finland.

First the trees are felled or cut down. The branches and leaves are removed. Then The trees are transported to the trunks. Next The bark is stripped from the
trunks. Also the trunks are swan into logs. They are conveyed to the paper mill. Then They are placed in the shredder. Next They are cut into small chips. They are mixed with water and acid. They are heated and crushed to a heavy pulp. This wood pulp is cleaned. It is also chemically bleached to whiten intuit is passed through rollers to flat ten it. Sheets of wet paper are produced. Then The water is removed from the sheets. Finally, these sheets are pressed, dried and refined until the finished paper is produced. Write a paragraph from the following suggested topic

Look at the picture and describe the processes involved in the production of the glass bottles.

Narrative task. Sometimes you can feel grateful not to get something you thought you really wanted. When I was 16, a local Italian- American organization offered a travel scholarship to three students. It sounded like an incredible opportunity. I immediately submitted my application for the scholarship. The three lucky students would go to Italy to study for the summer. They would live with Italian families and study Italian and other subjects at a local university. The scholarship would cover all the expenses including food. This was very important to me because my father was a factory worker and my
mother was a hairdresser, so money was tight. In addition, I was studying singing and loved opera. I was very excited about getting the chance to attend opera performances in Italy. In the end, a lot of students applied, so it was very competitive. When I found out I hadn't won a scholarship, I was so disappointed I almost cried. All of my dreams vanished. In order to make me feel a bit better, my mother bought tickets for the two of us to attend the performance of a local opera company. One of her clients from the hair salon arranged for us to go backstage after the performance. There I met the head of the opera company. When he heard that I wanted to be an opera singer, he invited me to audition for a summer internship with the company. I got the internship. Because of that, I got a scholarship to a great music school and finally go to Italy. But this time, I was actually singing in the opera rather than just watching it. I am so glad that I did not get what I thought I wanted.

Narrate your feelings, experiences, and your ideas about one of the similar topics.

A test in a particular school subject, A competition at school

In the process group, there were sequences of activities which occur in the writing phase of the lesson in four stages of prewriting, composing/drafting, revising, and editing in the writing phase of the lesson in addition to the same procedure of genre-based instruction which was used in the genre group. Learners were asked to write their own narrative composition based on a topic similar to the theme of the reading passages. Each student was asked to write the assigned writing on the basis of the process approach mentioned above. Once students produced a rough draft, they read it again and shared it with peers or a teacher in order to receive comments and feedback. Then they made modifications to their writings based on the feedback from their peers or a teacher; finally, they revised their second drafts and composed their writing. In the final stage emphasis is on correcting mechanical errors like grammatical accuracy, spelling or punctuation, as well as creativity and originality throughout the feedback delivery process.

Two written tasks were employed as the means of data collection for post-tests, respectively. Accuracy measure for the accuracy of written tasks was the number of error-free T-units per T-units
Design

The present study employed a quasi-experimental research design with a pre-test, treatment, and post-test design using intact EFL classrooms. The study consisted of two independent variables (process and genre groups), and one dependent variables (linguistic accuracy). In this study the following measurement was employed to quantify the written data collected from the participants. Written Accuracy Measure: The number of error-free T-units per T-units.

Results

T-test was employed as the statistical means of analysis for comparing the means of 2 groups in narrative task, as well as, written process task. Table 4.1 shows the results of descriptive statistics for the means of accuracy between process and genre groups in written narrative task.

Table 1
Descriptive statistics for comparison of Means of accuracy in narrative- written task

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>variable</th>
<th>condition</th>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Process-accuracy</td>
<td>Pre-test</td>
<td>Experimental</td>
<td>.3505</td>
<td>.19484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genre-accuracy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.3970</td>
<td>.17095</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Process-accuracy</td>
<td>Post-test</td>
<td>Experimental</td>
<td>.4060</td>
<td>.24332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genre-accuracy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.4140</td>
<td>.17689</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to table 1, the participants receiving genre-based instruction produced slightly more accurate language than learners who received process instruction in terms of their accuracy in written narrative task. Inferential statistics of Independent T-test was employed as the statistical means of analysis. The results are presented in the following table.
According to Table 2, although genre group outperformed process group; however, the result of inferential statistics of independent sample T-test revealed that there was not any significant difference between the means of accuracy of two groups in written narrative task and accordingly our hypothesis stating that “process and genre-based approaches are not differentially effective in the improvement of accuracy in narrative-task writing among intermediate EFL learners” was confirmed.

According to Table 3, genre-based group produced more accurate language than process group in written process task. The results are presented in the following table.
Table 4
Independent Samples T-test for the Accuracy of Written Process Task in Process and Genre groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Levene's Test for Equality of Variances</th>
<th>t-test for Equality of Means</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval of the Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Sig.</td>
<td>t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>post</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances assumed</td>
<td>.483</td>
<td>.450</td>
<td>2.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances not assumed</td>
<td>2.75</td>
<td>37.275</td>
<td>2.75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 shows the results of independent samples T-test for the accuracy of written production process task for both groups. The results of statistical analysis showed that there was significant difference between means of two groups in terms of accuracy. As a result, genre-based instruction was much more effective than process instruction in post-test. Therefore, the proposed hypothesis claiming that “process and genre-based approaches are not differentially effective in the improvement of accuracy in process-task writing among intermediate EFL learners” was rejected.

Discussion

In the present study, the effects of manipulating type of tasks (process, narrative) on written production in English were examined. The findings of this study can help us indicate how the accuracy dimension of production compete for attention during EFL task performance across two task types, and their possible interactions simultaneously.

The results of the study are in line with the findings of Martin (2009), Johns (2003), Hyland (2007), and Kuhi (2014) who supported the effectiveness and merits of genre-based approach on learners’ written performance. Similarly, Ding Eng Na (2009) investigated the effectiveness of using genre-based approach on EFL learners’ written production in the English for Specific
Purpose (ESP) context. The results of the study indicated that learners write better when they are made aware of the rhetoric structure and providing models of the communicative moves considered by the learners for inclusion in their texts. Also, Tangpermpoon (2008) showed that integrating the two approaches (genre and process) showed greater effect than using only one approach (product). In the same experimental study, Salimi (2012) studied the effect of intensive and extensive written tasks on grammatical accuracy of 60 Iranian EFL learners. He argued the effectiveness of written tasks on L2 learners’ written performance. Kongpetch (2006) studied using a genre-approach to teach writing to EFL students. He provided insights into the impact of the genre-based approach and implications for applying it to other educational contexts. Yayli (2011) proposed that the students displayed awareness of generic features and applied such knowledge to the practice of genres. Similar findings were reported by Huang (2014), he found that the student developed knowledge of the research article genre through assimilating explicit genre instruction. Considering the result of the effect of genre-based approach on L2 learners’ accuracy of written task performance, the findings ran against Freedman & Richardson (1997) that centered on the disjuncture between the claim that meaning is encapsulated in textual objects, genres as autonomous systems, and the avowal of a social constructionist functional model of language. Also, Dovey (2010) conducted a design-based research and the results obtained revealed that students who learned with the process-based curriculum design had better performance in writing than their counterparts in genre group. According to Byram (2004) genre underestimates the skills required to produce content, and learners’ self-sufficiency.

Regarding the hypothesis proposed which states “process and genre-based approaches are not differentially effective in the improvement of accuracy in process-task writing among intermediate EFL learners”, the results of data analysis (Independent Samples T-test) for written process-task production in post-test (Table 4.4) revealed that there was significant difference between the accuracy of the performance of process group and that of the genre group in written process task. As a result, the hypothesis regarding the results of data analysis for two groups in post-test was rejected. moreover, in terms of the means of the two groups, genre group produced more accurate language (0.415) than the accuracy of the performance of process group in written task.

Regarding the hypothesis which states “process and genre-based approaches are not differentially effective in the improvement of accuracy in narrative-task writing among intermediate EFL learners”. the results of data analysis proved that the difference among the accuracy of both groups was not
statistically significant. Accordingly, the proposed hypothesis for both groups in post-test was rejected.

Like every other experimental study, this study has also some limitations. First, individual differences and their possible effects on L2 learners’ performance was not taken into account in this study. Second, the study could be replicated with other language forms, tasks with other genres than narrative, levels of proficiency, and individual learner and social differences. Third, while genre-based teaching is most readily applicable to writing instruction, it may be and has been applied to the teaching of listening, speaking, and reading. The researches literature indicates, genre-based instruction has highly marked significance in language instruction, especially in writing skill, in which even those with high level of English proficiency lack the satisfactory ability to write efficiently and effectively. Students need to understand the various text forms and genres, and know how these work, so that they can make decisions about the kind of writing they are going to write. Thus, the results of this study can have illuminating effect on very important aspects of writing skill development. This study also carries some implications for second language acquisition (SLA) researchers, language teachers, and syllabus designers. Findings may also add to the present literature in SLA theory, language testing, syllabus design, and material development. Therefore, providing insights on designing and implementation of tasks based on genres and use benefits of this method in teaching in L2 classroom settings.

References


**Biodata**

**Zahra Talebi** is a PhD candidate in TEFL. She is currently a Head of English Language department at Payame-Noor University. She was distinguished and awarded as an exceptionally talented student in MA. Her research interests lie in the areas of writing, tasks, methodology and methods in ELT, syllabus design and focus-on-form.

**Nader Asadi** received his Ph.D. degree in applied linguistics from university of Sains, Malaysia in 2011. Dr Asadi has published two books and presented tens of papers in international conferences and journals. He has supervised many M.A and Ph.D. theses. His main areas of interest are Systemic Functional Linguistics & Grammar, Discourse analysis, Reading & Official Translation.

**Hanieh Davatgari** is the Head of English Language Department, and currently is an assistant professor at the University of Ahar. Her main areas of interest are task-based learning and teaching, applied linguistics, and second language acquisition (SLA).